

Message

From: Wassel, Ray [RWassel@nas.edu]
Sent: 1/26/2022 6:13:14 PM
To: Shams, Dahnish [Shams.Dahnish@epa.gov]
CC: Soto, Vicki [Soto.Vicki@epa.gov]; Beins, Kaley [KBeins@nas.edu]
Subject: RE: Task 2 - Updated One-Pagers NAS Workshops

Dahnish,

Thanks for the nice note.

--Ray

From: Shams, Dahnish <Shams.Dahnish@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, January 26, 2022 1:12 PM
To: Wassel, Ray <RWassel@nas.edu>
Cc: Soto, Vicki <Soto.Vicki@epa.gov>; Beins, Kaley <KBeins@nas.edu>
Subject: RE: Task 2 - Updated One-Pagers NAS Workshops

Ray – Thanks for letting Vicki and I know. We understand that there are a lot of activities ongoing and in particular, you’ve had to manage a lot of moving pieces. We are glad that Kaley can help you and us out with these workshops. I’ll include Kaley on our check-in calls moving forward and cc you on all our communications.

Kaley – I didn’t say this earlier, but Vicki and I both look forward to working with you. If there is anything you need, please just let us know.

- Dahnish

Chemical & Pollutant Assessment Division (CPAD)
Center for Public Health and Environmental Assessment (CPHEA)
Office of Research and Development, U.S. EPA
O: (202) 564-2758

From: Wassel, Ray <RWassel@nas.edu>
Sent: Monday, January 24, 2022 11:38 AM
To: Shams, Dahnish <Shams.Dahnish@epa.gov>
Cc: Soto, Vicki <Soto.Vicki@epa.gov>; Beins, Kaley <KBeins@nas.edu>
Subject: RE: Task 2 - Updated One-Pagers NAS Workshops

Dahnish,

Thanks for the note. We will send you a list of questions from the committee before the end of the day on Wednesday.

Since I have been the staff lead for several ongoing projects, it’s been quite challenging to make excellent progress on all fronts. To remedy the situation, I feel fortunate that Kaley Beins of BEST staff is able to take on the staff leadership role for both workshops under this task order. I will continue to provide staff support and feel confident that Kaley will do a great job in managing the project.

Going forward, Kaley should now be the main point of contact, and please copy me on emails as an alternate POC.

--Ray

From: Shams, Dahnish <Shams.Dahnish@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, January 24, 2022 9:50 AM
To: Wassel, Ray <RWassel@nas.edu>
Cc: Soto, Vicki <Soto.Vicki@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Task 2 - Updated One-Pagers NAS Workshops

Thanks Ray! I'll pass this on to the team, but I think the purpose was to focus on epidemiology. Not an expert on this, but as I understand it, the epidemiological concept of triangulation is not as developed and hence why it is the focus of the workshop. However, I'll let the team know that this is something that would like to be discussed on Friday.

Can you send any other questions in the next day or so? It would be helpful to make sure the team can answer any questions the committee may have when we talk on Friday.

- Dahnish

Chemical & Pollutant Assessment Division (CPAD)
Center for Public Health and Environmental Assessment (CPHEA)
Office of Research and Development, U.S. EPA
O: (202) 564-2758

From: Wassel, Ray <RWassel@nas.edu>
Sent: Thursday, January 20, 2022 6:41 PM
To: Shams, Dahnish <Shams.Dahnish@epa.gov>
Cc: Soto, Vicki <Soto.Vicki@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Task 2 - Updated One-Pagers NAS Workshops

Dahnish,

Thanks for the note. It raises a point that we should clarify: . . . "this workshop is intended to cover what triangulation looks like within a stream, specifically epidemiology."

During the committee meeting today, members tended to read the one-pager as saying the workshop should include some consideration of using triangulation for other kinds of studies, while focusing on its use for epi studies. See highlighted text in the attached one-pager.

It would be good to include as a topic for discussion on the 28th whether it would be helpful to include consideration of streams other than epi, to some extent.

There are a few other questions that came up today which we'll provide very soon.

Thanks again providing this response regarding the previous workshop.

--Ray

From: Shams, Dahnish <Shams.Dahnish@epa.gov>
Sent: Thursday, January 20, 2022 11:06 AM
To: Wassel, Ray <RWassel@nas.edu>
Cc: Soto, Vicki <Soto.Vicki@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Task 2 - Updated One-Pagers NAS Workshops

Hi Ray – Here is a response from the epi folks on the EPA side.

- Dahnish

I think that the statement was saying that we could apply the term, triangulation, to the process of integrating across evidence streams – human, animal and mechanistic, so our presentation on evidence integration in IRIS would be the pertinent one. But as the one-pager indicates, this workshop is intended to cover what triangulation looks like within a stream, specifically epidemiology. Kris' presentation ("Experience with Incorporating GRADE-Based Evidence Integration Frameworks into Environmental Health Evaluations") and Xabier's poster ("Evidence Synthesis and Integration in the IRIS Program") are two that address triangulation across evidence streams at EPA.

Chemical & Pollutant Assessment Division (CPAD)
Center for Public Health and Environmental Assessment (CPHEA)
Office of Research and Development, U.S. EPA
O: (202) 564-2758

From: Wassel, Ray <RWassel@nas.edu>
Sent: Wednesday, January 19, 2022 2:21 PM
To: Shams, Dahnish <Shams.Dahnish@epa.gov>
Cc: Soto, Vicki <Soto.Vicki@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Task 2 - Updated One-Pagers NAS Workshops

Dahnish,

In the one-pager on Triangulation that you provided, the background information section indicates: "Application of triangulation to integrate across evidence streams is an established approach to evidence integration in US EPA risk assessment, as discussed at a prior 2018 NAS workshop sponsored by EPA ("Evidence Integration in Chemical Assessments: Challenges Faced in Developing and Communicating Human Health Effect Conclusions")."

Do you recall what particular part(s) of that workshop EPA folks had in mind regarding discussion of triangulation? By the way, here is an active link to the presentation slide decks:

<https://www.nationalacademies.org/event/06-03-2019/workshop-evidence-integration-in-chemical-assessments-challenges-faced-in-developing-and-communicating-human-health-effect-conclusions> .

--Ray

From: Shams, Dahnish <Shams.Dahnish@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, June 12, 2020 2:03 PM
To: Wassel, Ray <RWassel@nas.edu>
Cc: Soto, Vicki <Soto.Vicki@epa.gov>
Subject: Task 2 - Updated One-Pagers NAS Workshops

Hi Ray – Attached to this email is the updated one pagers for the workshops.

To assist with the triangulation workshop, the EPA team has attached some examples (or provided a link for a longer one below) that may be informative to you. They specifically wanted to call out the Pearce et al study (it is cited in the one-pager). There is a table in this article that nicely conveys (particularly in the last row) the potential for triangulation to be applied in environmental epi in ways it has not been applied before. Our workshop aims to create a roadmap that would encourage this application of triangulation.

To assist with the data science/tools workshop, the EPA team has attached the "AI" presentation to this email.

Let us know if you have any follow up questions.

- Dahnish

Attachments or links for Triangulation Workshop:

Pearce et al. 2019

NTP. 2018. *Draft Report on Carcinogens Monograph on Night Shift Work and Light at Night. Peer Review Draft*. Research Triangle Park, NC: National Toxicology Program. 350 pp.

https://ntp.niehs.nih.gov/ntp/about_ntp/monopeer/vw/2018/october/landraftmonograph20180824.pdf.

Vandenbroucke JP et al 2016. Causality and causal inference in epidemiology: the need for a pluralistic approach. *Int J Epidemiol* 45(6): 1776-1786.

Vlaanderen et al. 2011. Occupational benzene exposure and the risk of lymphoma subtypes: a meta-analysis of cohort studies incorporating three study quality dimensions. *Environ Health Perspect* 119(2): 159-167.

Chemical and Pollutant Assessment Division (CPAD)

Center for Public Health and Environmental Assessment (CPHEA)

Office of Research and Development, U.S. EPA

O: (202) 564-2758